Access, Enrollment and Success: Statewide Results for Transfer-Level English and Math

Webinar
September 27, 2019

All Webinars Archived Here:

Full report:
Agenda

• Results from new RP Group/EdResults report: Access, Enrollment, and Success in Transfer-Level English and Math in the California Community College System

• If time permits:
  – Results from new Campaign for College Opportunity/California Acceleration Project report: Getting There: Are California Community Colleges Maximizing Student Completion of Transfer-Level Math and English?
  – Results from co-requisite models in Texas
Study Purpose

• To explore the statewide landscape as it pertains to enrollment, success and throughput in transfer-level English and math courses for students whose first enrollment was at that level.
  • To better understand trends in enrollment and success between fall 2015 and fall 2018 with a focus on shifts between fall 2017 and fall 2018.
Methodology

- Data from all community colleges
- Students enrolled between fall 2015 and fall 2018
- Credit math (N = 6,053,421) and English (N = 5,892,788)
- All transfer-level English courses
- All transfer-level math courses including math courses taught outside of the math discipline, such as Business Statistics
- Transfer level courses identified by CB05 and CB21 codes
- Enrollments and completions counted anywhere within the system
Findings: Access and Enrollment
Chart 1. Percentage of Students Who Enrolled Directly in Transfer-Level English and Math
Chart 2a. Enrollment in Transfer-Level English, Disaggregated by Ethnicity
Chart 3a. Enrollment in Transfer-Level Math, Disaggregated by Ethnicity
Summary of Findings: Access and Enrollment

1. In fall 2018 there were high rates of growth in students’ direct enrollment in transfer-level English and math as their first course in the discipline.

2. Equity gaps related to access and transfer narrowed with all racial/ethnic groups seeing a large gain in direct enrollment into transfer-level English and math, with the largest gains for African American and Latinx students.

3. Between fall 2017 and fall 2018, direct enrollment into transfer-level English increased by 16 percentage points and transfer-level math enrollment by 11 percentage points, despite all other English and math enrollments decreasing statewide.
Findings: Volume of Successful Completions
Chart 4. Year-Over-Year Change in the Number of Successful Completions of Transfer-Level English and Math
Chart 5a. Number and Percent of Additional Transfer-Level English Successes, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- White: 146% (n = 3,136)
- African American: 141% (n = 752)
- Asian: 77% (n = 2,780)
- Latinx: 74% (n = 10,569)
Chart 5. Term-to-Term Number of Additional Successful Completions of Transfer-Level English, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- **Asian**: Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 752, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 2,780, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 10,569
- **Latinx**: Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 3,136
- **African American**: Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 1,886, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 2,006, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 1,711
- **White**: Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 1,886, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 1,390, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 2,171
Chart 6a. Number and Percent of Additional Transfer-Level SLAM Successes, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- **African American:** 411% (n = 230)
- **Asian:** 112% (n = 743)
- **Latinx:** 131% (n = 2,827)
- **White:** 128% (n = 1,283)
Chart 6. Term-to-Term Number of Additional Successful Completions of Transfer-Level SLAM, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- **Asian:** Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 143, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 600, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 743
- **African American:** Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 143, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 600, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 230
- **Latinx:** Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 143, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 600, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 2,827
- **White:** Fall 2015 to Fall 2016 = 143, Fall 2016 to Fall 2017 = 600, Fall 2017 Fall 2018 = 1,283
Chart 7a. Number and Percent of Additional Transfer-Level B-STEM Successes, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- African American: 9800% (n = 99)
- Asian: 502% (n = 692)
- Latinx: 83% (n = 985)
- White: 66% (n = 369)
Chart 7. Term-to-Term Number of Additional Successful Completions of Transfer-Level B-STEM Math, Disaggregated by Ethnicity
1. Despite an influx of students into transfer-level English and math courses, student success has not declined—students. It seems, are rising to the occasion.

2. In fall 2018, 18,903 more students completed transfer-level English than in fall 2017, an 80% increase.

3. 5,552 more students completed a transfer-level statistics/liberal arts math (SLAM) class than in fall 2017, a 116% increase.

4. 2,261 more students completed a transfer-level Business-STEM (B-STEM course, a 103% increase.
Success and Performance:
By GPA Band
Chart 11. Success Rates in Transfer-Level English, Disaggregated by High School GPA Band

- **HSGPA < 1.9:**
  - Fall 2015: 41%
  - Fall 2016: 41%
  - Fall 2017: 41%
  - Fall 2018: 41%

- **HSGPA 1.9 - 2.6:**
  - Fall 2015: 53%
  - Fall 2016: 53%
  - Fall 2017: 53%
  - Fall 2018: 53%

- **HSGPA ≥ 2.6:**
  - Fall 2015: 77%
  - Fall 2016: 77%
  - Fall 2017: 77%
  - Fall 2018: 77%
Chart 12. Success Rates in Transfer-Level SLAM Students, Disaggregated by High School GPA Band
Chart 13. Success Rates in Transfer-Level B-STEM Math Students, Disaggregated by High School GPA Band
Summary of Findings: Success and Performance: By GPA Band

1. Success rates by GPA band are following similar patterns over the past four fall terms, with the highest success rates in the top GPA band and progressively lower rates in each lower band.

2. Colleges should consider recommending support to students in the middle and band and strongly encouraging additional support for students in the lowest GPA band to help maximize their chance of success.

3. The fact that small decreases in success rates by GPA band have been taking place over the past four fall terms, with no significant fluctuation between fall 2017 and fall 2018, suggests that there is no particular negative impact from AB 705 strategies on this aspect of student success.
Findings: Throughput
Chart 14. One-Term Throughput Rates for Transfer-Level English

- Fall 2015: 31%
- Fall 2016: 35%
- Fall 2017: 41%
- Fall 2018: 51%
Chart 15. One-Term Throughput Rates for Transfer-Level Math

- Fall 2015: 17%
- Fall 2016: 18%
- Fall 2017: 20%
- Fall 2018: 26%
Chart 16. One-Term Throughput Rates for Transfer-Level English, Disaggregated by Ethnicity
Chart 17. One-Term Throughput Rates for Transfer-Level Math, Disaggregated by Ethnicity

- African American
- Latinx
- White
- Asian

- Fall 2015:
  - African American: 8%
  - Latinx: 10%
  - White: 21%
  - Asian: 35%

- Fall 2016:
  - African American: 14%
  - Latinx: 18%
  - White: 21%
  - Asian: 33%

- Fall 2017:
  - African American: 14%
  - Latinx: 18%
  - White: 21%
  - Asian: 35%

- Fall 2018 (one term):
  - African American: 14%
  - Latinx: 18%
  - White: 21%
  - Asian: 46%
Summary of Findings: Throughput

1. One-term throughput rates, based on all starting levels, through transfer-level English and math, increased between fall 2017 and fall 2018. Though impacts on racial/ethnic gaps were mixed.
   - Transfer-level English increased 10 percentage points from 41% to 51%
   - Transfer-level math increased six percentage points from 20% to 26%

2. Direct placement into transfer-level English and math courses outperforms all levels of placement below transfer level, including being placed only one-level below transfer.

3. Despite the overall growth in one-term throughput for all racial/ethnic groups, the impacts on equity gaps was mixed.
Limitations

1. Only one-term throughput rates were possible to calculate due to data limitations.
2. While the completion of intermediate algebra for local degrees is included in AB 705, this analysis only looked at transfer-level courses.
3. New data elements will soon be available that will identify additional courses in the English and math TOP codes that meet transfer requirements.
4. The ability to examine the impact of support courses will also be possible moving forward due to course coding revisions.
5. Additional long-term outcomes can be tracked as time progresses.
Local and statewide analyses should survey the various approaches colleges are taking to support students both in and out of the classroom.

Throughput data, disaggregated by high school performance band, will be extremely valuable in comparing how a particular support or curricular structure is working with specific student groups.

Increased attention should be paid to students in the middle and lowest GPA bands—who are often from underrepresented groups—to ensure that the innovative supports and curriculum directed to these students is being effective at increasing the completion of transfer-level English and math within one year.

Instructional and counseling faculty and academic deans should work collaboratively with their institutional research, planning, and effectiveness offices, engaging in discussions around how the data is reflecting on the performance of current processes and practices.
Break for Questions
PAST WEBINAR: AB 705 IN ACTION! EXAMPLES FROM EARLY IMPLEMENTERS
Presentation
Recording

WORKSHOP: AB 705 AND ESL:
PREPARING FOR FALL 2020 IMPLEMENTATION
Friday, October 11 -- 9 to 2 pm
https://rpgroup.org/Events/Strengthening-Student-Success/Workshops

WEBINAR: ESL AND AB 705: RESEARCH AND IMPLEMENTATION
Wednesday, October 16 – 12 to 1 pm
https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/961620865

WEBINAR: ANALYSIS, EVALUATION AND COLLABORATION: AB 705 FOR INSTITUTIONAL RESEARCH PROFESSIONALS
Wednesday, November 13 – 12 to 1 pm
https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/293011422
Other Research
Getting There: Are California Community Colleges Maximizing Student Completion of Transfer-Level Math and English?

https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/getting-there/
Figure 5. AB 705 by Strength of Implementation

Implementation is much more uneven in math.

ENGLISH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% Transfer-Level Sections Offered</th>
<th>Number of Colleges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>below 70%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-89%</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90-100%</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MATH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% Transfer-Level Sections Offered</th>
<th>Number of Colleges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>below 70%</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-89%</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90-100%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: individual College Course Schedules

https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/getting-there/
Figure 6. Colleges Offering Corequisite Remediation at Transfer Level

The number of colleges offering corequisite remediation has grown considerably since the Fall of 2017, but still fewer than two-thirds of colleges in these regions offer such courses in STEM math classes.

Source: Individual College Course Schedules

https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/getting-there/
Figure 7. STEM Math Sections as a Percentage of Introductory Math Sections

Colleges continue to offer more STEM math sections than they need.

Nationally, 25% of students are estimated to be STEM majors.

Source: Individual College Course Schedules

https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/getting-there/
Random Controlled Trials in Texas of Corequisite Models
One-year RCT impact results are promising and aligned with previous studies

Percentage Passing English 1301 within One Academic Year

- Overall: Control 41.5%, Treatment 58.2%
- Hispanic: Control 41.1%, Treatment 61.5%
- First Generation College Student: Control 36.6%, Treatment 56.6%
- First Language Non-English: Control 45.4%, Treatment 65.0%

Note: All differences between control and treatment 1301 passing rates were statistically significant at the $p<0.01$ level.

All three corequisite models in the RCT showed positive one-year impacts

Percentage Passing English 1301 within One Academic Year

- Overall: 41.5% (Control), 58.2% (Treatment)
- Accelerated Learning Program: 41.1% (Control), 61.5% (Treatment)
- Extended Instructional Time: 36.6% (Control), 56.6% (Treatment)
- Required Support Service Use: 45.4% (Control), 65.0% (Treatment)

Our implementation framework includes nine sets of promising DE practices

- Accelerated opportunities to earn college credit
- Access to rigorous coursework and expectations
- Alignment of developmental education with college-level courses
- Student-centered instruction (e.g., differentiation, active learning)
- Integrated reading and writing instruction
- Intensive practice on key reading and writing skills
- Support for noncognitive and study skills
- Use of peers to support learning
- Elimination of negative stigma around participation in DE

Fall 2019 - RP Group Events

PAST WEBINAR: AB 705 IN ACTION! EXAMPLES FROM EARLY IMPLEMENTERS
Presentation
Recording

WEBINAR: ESL AND AB 705: RESEARCH AND IMPLEMENTATION
Wednesday, October 16 – 12 to 1 pm
https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/961620865

WORKSHOP: AB 705 AND ESL: PREPARING FOR FALL 2020 IMPLEMENTATION
Friday, October 11 -- 9 to 2 pm
https://rpgroup.org/Events/Strengthening-Student-Success/Workshops

WEBINAR: ANALYSIS, EVALUATION AND COLLABORATION: AB 705 FOR INSTITUTIONAL RESEARCH PROFESSIONALS
Wednesday, November 13 – 12 to 1 pm
https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/293011422