Strengthening Student Success

Scott E. Evenbeck, Ph.D.
Stella & Charles
Guttman Community College
October 6, 2016

theRPgroup, Learning Works
Garden Grove, CA
Contact Information

Scott E. Evenbeck
President
Stella and Charles Guttman
Community College
Scott.evenbeck@guttman.cuny.edu
50 West 40th Street
New York, NY 10018
646-313-8020 Tel
212-221-2396 Fax
Abstract

Building a New College: Lessons Learned

Higher education has never paid more attention to enhancing student success, retention, and graduation. Community colleges are the focus of unparalleled attention and support. In higher education circles and state and national agencies there exists a collective sense that community colleges must raise their game and have higher expectations for their success in serving the students who will define the country’s future. The City University of New York (CUNY) opened Stella and Charles Guttman Community College in 2012, drawing upon the best practices of other colleges and research findings on student success. What happened when students followed a guided pathway? When there was no separate developmental work? When there was sustained attention to learning outcomes using an electronic portfolio? What are the defining characteristics of the college? What elements are transportable?
Outline

• A New College
• Transportable Elements
• An Environmental Scan
• Crucial Elements
• Outcomes
• Comparisons
• Discussion
A New College
February 2008

CUNY Chancellor Matthew Goldstein initiates a process to develop a model for a new CUNY community college. Senior University Dean for Academic Affairs John Mogulescu and Project Director Tracy Meade lead a visionary group to develop ideas for a new approach to associate degree higher education based on research and best practices.
A New Community College
Concept Paper

August 15, 2008

The City University of New York
Office of Academic Affairs
535 East 80th Street
New York, NY 10021
April 2011

The New Community College Initiative holds its first faculty and staff retreat.
Vision Statement

Founded in the CUNY tradition of access to excellence, Stella and Charles Guttman Community College will support student achievement in a dynamic, inclusive and intellectually engaging environment. We will be recognized for the contributions of our students, faculty, staff and graduates to our communities and to a thriving, sustainable New York City.
Mission Statement

Stella and Charles Guttman Community College is an urban public institution that offers associate degree programs in an environment that nurtures student success. Based on extensive research, Guttman Community College integrates excellence in teaching, proactive and responsive student supports and external partnerships. Our primary objective is to increase the number of students, especially those not effectively served in higher education, who persist in their programs of study and attain a degree in a timely manner. We offer a clearly defined educational pathway including an integrated first-year curriculum that is inquiry-based and majors that prepare students for careers and baccalaureate study. Guttman programs are academically rigorous, multidisciplinary and experientially based.

Community is at the center of Guttman Community College’s mission, and students are at the center of the College. Guttman fosters an environment of cooperation and collaboration, where students, faculty and staff respect and appreciate each other’s perspectives, commonalities, differences and contributions. Students address compelling urban issues and move into the wider community through experiential learning and internships. Graduates will have the intellectual tools and confidence to be engaged citizens and responsible leaders.

College is a time and a place and an idea—an opportunity to cultivate the knowledge and experience required to meet intellectual, creative and professional goals. Guttman Community College supports students in developing the capacity to interpret and evaluate ideas they encounter both in and out of the classroom and to make informed judgments. Students will learn to express their ideas effectively and know that their voices are valued. They will graduate with a greater sense of responsibility for their academic success and personal growth, prepared to pursue additional studies, a career and lifelong learning.
Learning Outcomes

Stella and Charles Guttman Community College’s learning outcomes encourage students to aim high and provide them with a framework for their entire educational experience, connecting school, college, work and life. These outcomes build on Lumina Foundation’s Degree Qualifications Profile and are informed by AAC&U’s LEAP Essential Learning Outcomes. They are an inclusive framework for a contemporary liberal education, defined not as a selected set of disciplines, but as a set of knowledge and skills for all aspects of life: school, work, citizenship, and social responsibility. They are reflective of the college’s mission and values.

Students will know from the time they enter Guttman Community College that they will be expected to demonstrate progress in achieving these outcomes. Institutional learning outcomes will be addressed at the course and program level. They will be based on integrative learning in and beyond the classroom and will be assessed via students’ coursework as collected and presented in their e-portfolios.
Values and Culture:

• The New Community College seeks to creates a culture that values:

• Creativity, innovation, nimbleness and teamwork

• Diversity in all its complexities

• Openness to multiple perspectives

• High expectations for all members of its community

• The multiple roles and varied contributions of every member

• A collective commitment to student success

• External partnerships and community engagement

• Teaching and learning in and out of the classroom

• Assessment that informs student learning, professional development and improves institutional practice

• The potential of all of its members to be agents of change
May 2011

The College establishes residency at 50 West 40th Street.
The New York State Board of Regents approves the amendment to CUNY’s long-range master plan authorizing the establishment of The New Community College at CUNY.
NCC COUNTDOWN TO OPENING
June 2011 – June 2012

**Milestone partially met**

**Milestone no longer applicable**

**June 2011:**
- NCC approved by NYS Board of Regents
- FY2012 budget request of $11.3M approved

**July 2011:**
- Provost & fall 2011 new faculty & staff hiring offers made
- FY12 staff hiring plans approved for fall 2011 searches

**August 2011:**
- Commitment for Financial Aid Replacement Funds secured
- Master Plan Amendment approved by Governor Cuomo

**September 2011:**
- NCC marketing campaign underway; Web site goes live and recruitment begins
- NCC FY2013 budget request for $13.1M submitted

**October 2011:**
- Advisory Council Meeting is held
- Classroom, library, & office furnishings completed
- Searches for fall 2012 faculty underway
- Network Infrastructure completed

**January 2012:**
- Partnerships outreach in progress
- Center for College Effectiveness opens

**February 2012:**
- BRKFI personnel hired for 2012 enrollment management
- Installation/testing of smart classroom technology completed

**March 2012:**
- Research studies approved by Community College IRB
- First students accepted

**April 2012:**
- NCC goes live in CUNYfirst
- Pathways Implementation Plan submitted and courses presented for review
- Final offers on fall 2012 faculty/staff hires made
- Build out of science labs completed

**May 2012:**
- Revisions to programs of study for Pathways begin

**June 2012:**
- NCC FY2013 budget allocation approved
- NCC READY TO OPEN
- WITH SUMMER PROGRAM

**December 2011:**
- All curriculum & assessment pilots completed

**November 2011:**
- Administrative outsourcing synchronized with CUNY campuses
- NCC operationalized in CUNYfirst
Inaugural Commencement August 27, 2014
Inaugural Commencement August 27, 2014
Guttman Hosts Citizenship Now!
Guttman’s Global Ambassadors Take Off for Germany
College Hosts Advisory and Research Council Meeting
Commencement 2015
Black Male Initiative
Global Guttman Alaska 2016
Global Guttman in Nicaragua 2016
Transportable Elements
Transportable Elements

- Clear Pathways from High School and GED Programs to GCC
- Information Sessions
- Bridge
- Integrated Developmental Education
- Full-time Enrollment in the First Year
- Learning Community
  - Including City Seminar and Ethnographies of Work
- Integration of Curriculum with Co-Curricular Activities and Experiential Education
- Focus on Assessment and Evaluation
Transportable Elements

- Team Approach to Instruction
  - Faculty Across Disciplines
  - Advisors and Mentors on the Teams
  - Librarians Integral to Curriculum Development

- Centered on Student Learning
  - Student Learning Outcomes and Assessment via Electronic Portfolio

- IT Central to the Work
  - Electronic Resource
  - Library
  - E-Port

- Integration of School with Work (preparatory to work)

- Focus on Both: Getting a Job and Finishing a Baccalaureate Degree

- Peer Mentors

- Centered on the City

- Taking Things to Scale
An Environmental Scan
GUIDELINES FOR STUDENT SUCCESS
TERRY O’BANION, MARCH 2014

1. Every student will make a significant connection with another person at the college as soon as possible.
2. Key intake programs including orientation, assessment, advisement, and placement will be integrated and mandatory.
3. Every student will be placed in a “program of study” from day one; undecided students will be placed in a mandatory “program of study” designed to help them decide.
4. Every student who enrolls to pursue a certificate, degree, or who plans to transfer will work with college personnel to create a student success pathway – a roadmap to completion.
5. Every student will be carefully monitored throughout the first term to ensure successful progress; the college will make interventions immediately to keep students on track.
6. Students will engage in courses and experiences designated to broaden and deepen their learning.
HOW TO TRANSFORM COMMUNITY COLLEGES FOR STUDENT SUCCESS
BYRON MCCLENNEY, 2014

1. Evaluate interventions and practices
2. Recruit a diverse group of administrators, faculty, and staff
3. Make choices of appropriate technology to enhance teaching and learning
4. Foster data-informed decision making
5. Implement high impact practices at scale
Redesigning America’s Community Colleges

Thomas R. Bailey, Shanna Smith Jaggars, and Davis Jenkins
Rethink ways for organizing programs of study, support services, and instruction.

Cafeteria Model Vs. Guided Pathways
### Entry Phase: From Enrollment to Entry into Program of Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cafeteria college student</th>
<th>Guided pathways college student</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skips optional orientation, meets with advisor to select first-term courses</td>
<td>Based on required orientation, career assessment, and advising, selects business meta-major and begins degree plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despite interest in business, takes no business courses; unaware of college career center</td>
<td>Takes prescribed first-year sequence, including a business course and a business-focused student success course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placed in remedial math based on standardized test, will need 2 semesters to get to college-level math</td>
<td>Takes statistics-oriented math course that enables her, despite not having liked math in high school, to complete college-level math in 2 semesters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disengaged by lecture-based courses</td>
<td>Engaged particularly in social science course, based on topical readings and participation in class projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Lacks direction**
- **Getting discouraged**

- **Has program goal and completion term**
- **Gaining early momentum**

## Progress Phase: From Program Entry to Completion of Program Requirements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cafeteria college student</th>
<th>Guided pathways college student</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer self-advising leads to extra courses/excess credits</td>
<td>E-advising system enables student and her advisor to monitor progress on student’s degree plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fails Economics 101, considers retaking it</td>
<td>Early alert initiated by Economics 101 instructor leads advisor to recommend tutoring, which enables her to pass the course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not participate in clubs or activities</td>
<td>Participates in young entrepreneur club suggested by business faculty; this helps connect her with internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not know college has transfer assistance center</td>
<td>Applies to business programs at 2 universities with assistance from department advisors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Still lacks direction
Getting discouraged

Has program goal and completion plan
Builds on early momentum

---

## Completion Phase: Completion of Credential of Value for Further Education and Labor Market Advancement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cafeteria college student</th>
<th>Guided pathways college student</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Has not completed business program after 5 years of sporadic, part time enrollment</td>
<td>Completes business program in 2 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realizes that some of the courses she took will not transfer for credit toward business program at state university; discovers that the university’s business program has restricted enrollment; decides to graduate with a general studies associate degree</td>
<td>Accepted into bachelor’s program at state university; transfers all credits for junior standing in major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continues working in low-wage jobs</td>
<td>Works part-time at marketing company where she interned, while starting at the university</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disengaged by lecture-based courses</td>
<td>Engaged particularly in social science course, based on topical readings and participation in class projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Earns a general studies degree**
- **Employed in a series of low-wage jobs**

- **Graduates in 2 years**
- **On track to complete bachelor’s in 5 years**
- **Employed part-time in field of interest**

Roles in the Redesign Process

Faculty Members and Academic Administrators:

- Create maps for all programs
- Built partnership with transfer destination program faculty and with employers
- Focus on building skills, concepts, and habits of mind
- Create an infrastructure for faculty support

Student Services Staff and Administrators:

- Work with faculty to design a mandatory process for program exploration and selection
- Implement E-advising tools that can facilitate monitoring and support for student progress along program pathways

Institutional Researchers:

- Track loss and momentum points along student’s path through college
- Follow students as they continue their education
- Follow students into their career

College CEO’s and Other Top Administrators:

- Reflect on commitment to student success in budgetary decisions
- Rethink committee structures to focus on student success
- Hire and promote faculty and staff with a strong commitment to improving students’ outcomes

Guided Pathways to Success (GPS)

• Whole Programs of Study – Students choose coherent programs not random, individual courses.

• No Wasted Credits – All courses count toward degree.

• Informed Choice – Choice becomes more informed, deliberate and simpler.

• Default Pathways – Students remain on their chosen path unless given approval to change.

• Intrusive, on time advising - Academic advising is intrusive, just in time, efficient and cost effective.

• 15 to finish – All degree pathways are built for on time graduation.

• Block Schedules – Highly structured schedules add event more student success.

• Clear Progress to Guaranteed Courses- Students receive real-time feedback.

• End- to- End design – Students are more motivated to fulfill their career goals.

• Milestone Courses- Milestone courses signal student success.

• Workforce connection – States and students win as GPS creates academic maps to high demand jobs.
How to improve student persistence and completion


By: Vincent Tinto, September 26, 2016
Self- Efficacy

Self-efficacy refers to a person’s belief in their ability to succeed at a particular task on in a specific situation. It is one manifestation of how past experiences shape how individuals come to perceive themselves and their capacity to have some degree of control over their environment. Self-efficacy is learned, not inherited. It is malleable, not fixed. It is not generalizable in that it applies to all tasks and situations but can vary depending on the particular task on situation at hand. A person may feel capable of success at one task but not another.

To obtain the timely support they need to succeed when they encounter early difficulties in meeting the academic, and sometimes social, demands of college. To be effective, such support must occur before student struggles undermine their motivation to persist – thus the need for institutions to employ early-warning systems that, when properly implemented, alert faculty and staff to struggling students and trigger support when needed. Midterm grades will not do.
Sense of Belonging

Students have to come to see themselves as a member of a community of other students, faculty and staff who value their membership – that they matter and belong.

Students who perceive themselves as belonging are more likely to persist because it leads not only to enhanced motivation but also a willingness to become involved with others in ways that further promote persistence.
Perceived Value of the Curriculum

Although what constitutes value is subject to much debate, the underlying issue is clear: Students need to perceive the material to be learned is of sufficient quality and relevance to warrant their time and effort.

First, institutions should see to it that students enroll in a field of study appropriate to their needs, and interests, that they fine the material within those courses sufficiently challenging to warrant their effort and, with academic support, reasonably within their reach to master. Second, they should ensure that the curriculum – is particular, but not only, in the social sciences and humanities – is inclusive of the experiences and histories of the students who are asked to study that curriculum. Third, institutions, specifically the faculty, should be explicit in demonstrating how the subjects that students are asked to learn can be applied to meaningful situations in ways that have relevance to issues that concern them.
Perceived Value of the Curriculum continued

One way of making those connections is to use pedagogies, such as problem and project based learning, that require students to apply the material they are learning to resolve concrete problems or to complete a project that frames the class. Another is through contextualization, where students are asked to learn material within the context of another field.

Colleges and universities can also achieve contextualization through the use of learning communities.
Crucial Elements
\[ B = f(P, E) \]
Hands On
Impact of Educationally Purposeful Activities on the Probability of Returning for the Second Year of College by Race

- Blue line: African American
- Red line: White/Caucasian

At: http://nsse.iub.edu/pdf/connecting_the_dots_report.pdf
Outcomes
### STELLA AND CHARLES GUTTMAN COMMUNITY COLLEGE

#### Overview
- First CUNY community college in 40 years
- Opened in August 2012
- Located in midtown Manhattan overlooking Bryant Park and the New York Public Library
- Integrates curriculum with co-curricular activities and experiential education

#### Fall 2016 Entering Students
- 100% of freshmen are full-time
- 55% female and 45% male
- Students from all boroughs
  - Bronx (32%), Manhattan (27%), Brooklyn (22%), Queens (12%), Staten Island (<1%)
- Diverse student body*
  - Hispanic (61%), African American (26%), White (9%), Asian/Pacific Islander (4%)

#### Fall 2016 All Students
- 86% of all students are full-time
- 55% female and 45% male
- Students from all boroughs
  - Bronx (33%), Manhattan (26%), Brooklyn (23%), Queens (15%), Staten Island (<1%)
- Diverse student body*
  - Hispanic (60%), African American (26%), White (10%), Asian/Pacific Islander (5%)

*Fall 2015 race/ethnicity data
**Enrollment Growth**
Fall 2012 enrollment: 289
Fall 2013 enrollment: 493
Fall 2014 enrollment: 691
Fall 2015 enrollment: 824
Fall 2016 enrollment: 981

**Fall to Spring Retention Rates**
Fall 2012 cohort fall-spring: 92%
Fall 2013 cohort fall-spring: 88%
Fall 2014 cohort fall-spring: 90%
Fall 2015 cohort fall-spring: 88%*

**2016-2017 Tuition & Financial Aid**
Tuition and Fees: $5192.90
Students Awarded Pell: 73%*

**Graduation Rates**
Fall 2012 3-yr graduation rate: 49%
Fall 2013 3-yr graduation rate: 44%

**Student Characteristics**
Fall 2016 First Generation: 61%
Fall 2016 Students w/ Disabilities: 22%

**Fall to Fall Retention Rates**
Fall 2012 cohort 1-yr retention: 74%
Fall 2013 cohort 1-yr retention: 69%
Fall 2014 cohort 1-yr retention: 73%
Fall 2015 cohort 1-yr retention: 70%*

**Fall to Spring Retention Rates**
Fall 2012 cohort fall-spring: 92%
Fall 2013 cohort fall-spring: 88%
Fall 2014 cohort fall-spring: 90%
Fall 2015 cohort fall-spring: 88%*

*Preliminary
Fall 2016 student demographics (N=981)

Residence

- Bronx 33%
- Manhattan 26%
- Brooklyn 23%
- Queens 15%
- Other 4%
- Staten Island <1%
FALL 2016 STUDENT DEMOGRAPHICS (N=981)
FULL-TIME/PART-TIME STATUS
**FALL 2016 STUDENT DEMOGRAPHICS (N=981)**

**AGE**

- **Age 25 and over**: 1%
- **Age 30 and over**: 1%
- **Age 22-24**: 1%
- **Age 20-21**: 26%
- **Age 18-19**: 29%
- **Age under 18**: 42%
FALL 2016 STUDENT DEMOGRAPHICS (N=981)

GENDER

Women 55%

Men 45%
FALL 2015 STUDENT DEMOGRAPHICS (N=824)
RACE/ETHNICITY

- Black: 26%
- White: 10%
- Asian or Pacific Islander: 5%
- [CATEGORY NAME] [VALUE]
## SATISFACTION & ENGAGEMENT

Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory

### Guttman to Peer Comparison

**Spring 2015**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction Mean Ratings</th>
<th>Acad. Advising</th>
<th>Concern for the Individual</th>
<th>Admiss. and Fin. Aid</th>
<th>Instructional Effectiveness</th>
<th>Registration</th>
<th>Student Centered</th>
<th>Acad. Svcs.</th>
<th>Campus Climate</th>
<th>Service Excellence</th>
<th>Campus Support Services</th>
<th>Safety and Security</th>
<th>Responsive to Diverse Populations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guttman</strong></td>
<td>5.89</td>
<td>5.71</td>
<td>5.62</td>
<td>5.62</td>
<td>5.57</td>
<td>5.64</td>
<td>5.59</td>
<td>5.60</td>
<td>5.51</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>5.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Community College Average</strong></td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.34</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>5.51</td>
<td>5.53</td>
<td>5.48</td>
<td>5.62</td>
<td>5.43</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>5.23</td>
<td>5.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ratings are based on a 7-point scale*
SATISFACTION & ENGAGEMENT
CCSSE

Guttman to Peer Comparison
Spring 2016

*Top-Performing colleges are those that scored in the top 10 percent of the cohort by benchmark.
Comparisons
Pell Recipients

- National Community Colleges
- Peers
- Guttman

Source: Fall 2014 IPEDS
Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Category</th>
<th>National Community Colleges</th>
<th>Peers</th>
<th>Guttman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age under 18</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 18-19</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 20-21</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 22-24</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 25 and over</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Fall 2014 IPEDS
Race/Ethnicity

Source: Fall 2014 IPEDS
# COMPLETION & TRANSFER

## Graduation Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guttmann - Peer Comparison</th>
<th>3-yr Graduation Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guttmann Fall 2012 Cohort</td>
<td>Comparable Institutions Fall 2012 Cohort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Guttmann Comparison Over Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fall 2012 Cohort 3-yr graduation rate</th>
<th>Fall 2013 Cohort 3-yr graduation rate (*projected)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>49%</td>
<td>45%*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion