"Designing an Equity-Embedding Framework for Online Student Success"

OEI Student Services

April 12, 2018

Arnita Porter & Jessica Hurtado
THE ONLINE EDUCATION INITIATIVE

The Online Education Initiative (OEI) is a collaborative effort among California Community Colleges (CCCs) to ensure that significantly more students are able to complete their educational goals by increasing both access to and success in high-quality online courses.

• The OEI is composed of high quality online courses, resources for online students, and technology resources:
THE OEI’S FOCUS

- Common Course Management System – Canvas (110 CCC’s have adopted)
- Development of **Online Student Support Services**
- Develop CCC Course Exchange
- Collaborate with CCC faculty to develop quality online courses
HOW OEI SUPPORTS STUDENT SERVICES

OEI seeks to seamlessly incorporate Student Services into Distance Education Programs by:

• Supporting students beyond classroom instruction

• Enhancing distance education programs through online support services

• Helping colleges meet accreditation standards
THE FUTURE:
STUDENT SUPPORT SERVICES HUB

- Online Student Equity
- Early Alert
- Online Counseling Network & Platform
- Front Line Services
- Online Readiness (Quest Program)
- Online Tutoring 24/7
- Online Peer to Peer Mentoring
- Online Library Services
- Online Proctoring and Assessment
- Accessibility Support & Universal Design

canvas
Common Course Management System

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office

California Community Colleges Online Education Initiative
ONLINE COUNSELING

• Designed specifically for Student Services
• Online career counseling appointments
• Online academic advising appointments
• Online drop-in / walk-in counseling sessions
• Interactive student success workshops for online students
• Online Mental Health appointments
• FERPA & ADA Accessibility Compliant
• **ALL** on campus counseling services can be provided via this platform
• Zero cost to participating OEI colleges

http://blog.conexed.com/conexed/
ONLINE COUNSELING

Professional Development Courses:

1. Online College Counseling Course
   https://ccconlineed.instructure.com/courses/1876

1. Distance Mental Health Courses
   – MH Clinicians
   – General Counselors
   https://ccconlineed.instructure.com/courses/1598
ONLINE READINESS MODULES

**Goal:** Assist California Community College students in developing the skills required to be successful online learners.

**Misconception:** Students, while they may be savvy with smart-phones, tablets, and/or computer users, may not be prepared for the particular challenge of college level learning in the online environment.

**Access to this tool:** Colleges can easily include these resources in existing online courses and learning environments.

**Multimedia Tutorials**
Available for free via Creative Commons licensing and which may be repurposed to meet the unique needs of an individual college.
ONLINE PEER MENTORING

Mission:
To promote student success by connecting online students with mentors to encourage online student community and engagement. Leveraging emerging technologies to foster student equity in the online environment.

Activities to promote student engagement:

- Workshops
- One on one check-in’s (ConexED)
- Facilitate community discussions (Notebowl)
- Classroom technology assistance (Canvas-Student perspective)
- Connecting online students to both in person and online resources
FRONTLINE SERVICES

How can we use online tools to make the onboarding process fully online?

Can we provide our online students support in real time? [http://www.craniumcollege.com/]

**Frontline Services:**
Financial Aid
Admissions
Counseling

Registration/Fees
DSPS
...

[Images of contact information for Seth Jensen and Heather Lund]
OEI EQUITY ACCOMPLISHMENTS (system-wide)

- Provide access to system-wide equity friendly online support services
  - Online Counseling – 40% of colleges
  - Online Student Readiness Resources - 100%
  - Financial Aid - Access for maximum Financial Aid benefits in the Exchange Consortium Agreement, increase the amount of financial aid underrepresented can receive when taking online course via Exchange

- Engaged in research and development with CUE, PPIC & RP Group
- Developed an Online Student Equity Framework for colleges
- Begun designing online withdrawal data tool
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Online Student Equity
- Equity & CRTL in the Online Learning Environment

Online Counseling Network
- Equity & CRTL for Counseling
- Online College Counseling Course
- Online MH Counseling Course
  - MH Clinicians
  - General Counselors

Front Line Services
- Equity & CRTL for Front Line Staff

Online Peer to Peer Mentoring
- Equity & CRTL for Online Peer Mentors

Accessibility Support & Universal Design
- Creating Accessible Course Content

Online Tutoring 24/7
- Equity & CRTL for Tutoring

Canvas Common Course Management System

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office
Latinos are the single largest ethnic group in California Community Colleges

In 2016-17, 99 out of 114 California Community Colleges had enough Latinos to qualify as Hispanic Serving Institutions

Collectively, these 39 colleges enroll 61% of all 1 million Latinos attending California Community Colleges

@CollegeOpp

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office
The number of California Black and Latino students who don’t graduate with their cohort each year could fill the Staples Center more than 3 times.
ONLINE STUDENT EQUITY

- More than 27% of students at public CC take some or all of their classes online (PPIC 2015).

- Over 67% of CCC students are people of diverse ethnic backgrounds and roughly 53% are female.

- Traditionally, marginalized students experience barriers that result in disparate course and degree completion rates and inequitable outcomes.

- 7 – 9% Achievement gap in online learning

(The future of Education 4th edition. Julie A. Zaloudek University of Wisconsin)
GOALS

OEI
To increase student COMPLETION of courses, degrees and transfer requirements, by providing access to quality online courses and online support services.

Student Equity Work Group - April 2016
Collaborative efforts between ASCCC appointed faculty, administrators, counselors, researchers and instructional designers,

Student Equity
- To work with the CCCCO Equity division to encourage the inclusion of online students as part of a college’s Student Equity Plan
- To encourage intentional proactive valuing of diversity regarding online students from the beginning (rather than accommodating later)
- Decrease success rate gaps in online courses (7 - 9%)
- Identify disparities, challenges, and strategies to address inequities
- Implementation of Equity Framework
Chancellor’s Vision for Success
CCC Goals by 2022

- **Increase** associates degrees, credentials, certificates, or specific skill sets for in-demand jobs. (20%)
- **Increase** annual transfers to UCs or CSUs. (35%)
- **Decrease** average number of units for associate’s degrees, from approximately 87 to 79 total.
- **Increase** the percent of gainfully employed CTE students from 60% to 69%
- **Reduce** equity gaps and cut achievement gaps by 40% within 5 years; fully close gaps within 10 years.
ONLINE EQUITY CONCERNS

• Students who took an online version of the same courses were 11% less likely to finish and pass than those who took it in-person—despite usually being stronger students.

• Online students were also less likely to receive a "B" grade or higher than in-person students of similar academic and economic backgrounds (University of California-Davis Researchers 2015)
Theory of Change: We provide information and training on equity and culturally responsive teaching and learning pedagogy, and use action research methodologies. California community college professionals will transform their online education environments to meet the needs of a diverse student population and increase students’ ability to succeed.

Change of Online Student Equity Work Group: To identify disparities and challenges associated with online student equity and identify strategies to address these inequities as it relates to course and degree completion in the California Community College system. To promote effective equity-minded culturally responsive teaching and learning practices for online education that produce equitable outcomes for students in the classroom, in the delivery of services, and within the online environment.

Implementation of Success Strategies:
- Colleagues implement OEI Online Student Equity Success Strategies
- Framework to Reduce Equity Gaps
- Colleagues adding Online Education to Student Equity
- College Success Plans (Integrated), institutional student services, and online campus environment
- Empowering Online Educators through Equity Practitioners
- Community of Practice, Prof Dev, Resources
- Beyond 2018: Equity/CRT added in CCC online education environment
- Faculty, Staff, Administrators are equity-minded and culturally responsive

External Factors:
- Resistance to acknowledging the presence of structural racism, institutional policies and daily practices that enact barriers for identified groups.

Assumptions:
- OEI is focused on increasing student success and retention, ensuring students complete their educational goals.
Six Success Factors

- Students have a goal & know how to achieve it
- Students stay on track—keeping their eyes on the prize
- Students feel somebody wants & helps them to succeed
- Students actively participate in their learning both in & out of class

- Students’ skills, talents, abilities & experiences are recognized; they have opportunities to contribute on campus & feel their contributions are appreciated

- Students feel like they are part of the college community

Support from the Student Perspective

- How do students perceive support on their campuses?
- Research performed with over 900 California community college students indicates that they have a very broad definition—different from how practitioners often think of and deliver these services. Where we see divisions, departments, organizational charts, and reporting hierarchies, students see people who, regardless of job title or position, can help them reach their goals.

What we see...

What the student experiences...

- Special Populations Programs

What can you do on your campus to rethink student support?

- For more information, visit www.rpgroup.org/projects/student-support

Conducted by the RP Group | Supported by The Kresge Foundation

California Community Colleges Online Education Initiative
USC CENTER FOR URBAN EDUCATION

DEVELOPING A PRACTICE OF
Equity Minded Indicators

1. Do you routinely examine and report racial/ethnic participation in:
   - Honors program
   - Institutional scholarships
   - Participation in undergraduate research
   - Study abroad
   - Transfer from community college to four-year college
   - Transfer from community college to highly selective four-year colleges
   - Internships and other forms of high-value experiences
   - Student surveys
   - Fields of study
   - Graduation with honors
2. Do you have a set of racial equity indicators that you monitor annually?
   _No_ _Yes _describe_
3. Does your campus have goals that are explicitly stated by race and ethnicity to improve retention, graduation, STEM participation, and [Name other indicators that are important at your own institution]
4. Does your campus recruit community college transfer students and report on transfer access by race and ethnicity?
5. Does your campus publish an annual report on the status of racial equity? If it does not, who would need to make it happen?
6. Does your campus report on admissions applications, acceptance, and yield by race and ethnicity? Does your campus report on incomplete admissions applications by race and ethnicity?
7. Are you familiar with your campus recruitment and admissions practices? Is there a racial/ethnic map of the high schools where recruitment takes place?
8. Are faculty, administrators, and staff evaluated on meeting racial equity goals?
9. Does your campus report on faculty, administrator, and staff hiring outcomes by race/ethnicity for faculty, e.g., number of applicants, number interviewed, and number hired? Has your campus for you conducted a study of faculty search procedures to identify implicit bias in standard search procedures?
10. Would your campus leadership be open to routinely examine practices, policies, new initiatives, reports, etc., to determine if they meet criteria of equity-mindedness?
11. Would your vice president of academic affairs, deans, and department chairs be open to engaging faculty in the examination of course-level data disaggregated by race and ethnicity? To examine their syllabi? To conduct classroom observations to understand interracial relations between instructors and students?
12. How much support would you get from your president to do items 11 and 12? The academic senate? Trustees?

The Center for Urban Education created the concept of “equity-mindedness” to describe actions that demonstrate individuals’ capacity to recognize and address racialized structures, policies, and practices that produce and sustain racial inequities. 
(Bensimon & Malcom, 2012; Dowell & Bensimon, 2015).

Criteria of equity-mindedness are available in CUE’s website http://cue.usc.edu

Five Principles for Creating Equity by Design

Reducing inequities in educational attainment by race and ethnicity will require deliberate and explicit effort. In this handout, we outline strategies for higher education institutions to take action based on the five overarching principles for ensuring equity by design:

Principle 1: Clarity in language, goals, and measures is vital to effective equitable practices.
Principle 2: ‘Equity-mindedness’ should be the guiding paradigm for language and action.
Principle 3: Equitable practice and policies are designed to accommodate differences in the contexts of student’s learning—not to treat all students the same.
Principle 4: Enacting equity requires a continual process of learning, disaggregating data, and questioning assumptions about relevance and effectiveness.
Principle 5: Equity must be enacted as a pervasive institutional- and system-wide principle

*The content in this handout was adapted from America’s Unmet Promise: The imperative for equity in Higher Education, edited by Winborne, K., Alston-Hippakas, L. L., Dowell, A. C., and Bensimon, E. M. (2015). To order a copy of this publication or to learn about other AmChic publications, visit www.amchic.org.

Copyright 2015 University of Southern California, Center for Urban Education, Rossier School of Education. All rights reserved.

Contact: cue@usc.edu | 213.740.5352
Meanings of Culture and Race
Culture is everywhere
Race matters

Exploring Mindsets and Learning
Fixed vs. Growth Mindset Praising Effort

Learning Barriers
Unconscious Bias, Microaggressions, Privilege & Power,
Overcoming Stereotype Threat

Social Capital and Learning
Who you know greatly influences what you will learn and know.
Importance of creating “knowledge” capital networks
Access to certain social resources within networks of people and knowledge systems.

Google: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nLiFTHTeEVU](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nLiFTHTeEVU)
Hidden Bias Test (Project Implicit):
Equity-Minded Worksheet for Instructors of Online Courses

Principle 1: Inclusivity
Instructor communicates that all students are important and equal partners in the education process and acts in inclusive ways that demonstrate respect for all students and their contributions.

General Characteristics:

1. Provide course guidelines for respectful communication that promote inclusivity, reduce polarization and marginalization.

   Examples
   a. Encourage regular, open and inclusive communication on discussion boards and in collaborations among all students and instructor
   b. Intervene promptly when communication guidelines are not followed.
   c. Set up an online buddy system.
   d. Your own examples:

2. Foster a spirit of collaboration and equal partnership and encourage student ownership of course.

   Examples
   a. Offer students multiple means of providing formal and informal course feedback (e.g., anonymous Qualtrics survey; mid-semester evaluation).
   b. Allow students to use this inventory to give feedback on course inclusivity and diversity sensitivity.
   c. Create mechanisms for students to leave anonymous feedback or contact instructor.
   d. Explore ways of actively transforming learners into teachers.
   e. Include student input when designing assignments and discussion topics.
   f. Solicit student feedback about their prior active-learning experiences, encourages them to propose alternatives, and considers implementing their suggestions.
   g. Incorporate learning spaces that are driven by student voices (special forum with introductions using videos, pictures, cultural symbolism, assignment options, and video).
   h. Your own examples:

Created by University of Wisconsin – Green Bay, v.1
A mechanism to support colleges in creating equity-centered short-term and long-term strategic goals and objectives that will

- assist with assessing successes and data
- ensure online programs polices and practices are viewed through an equity lens
- be implemented using the strength-based process of Appreciative Inquiry (AI)
ONLINE EQUITY FRAMEWORK

Student Services
Instruction & Course Design
Institution

Research & Professional Development

Access & Support

Equity & Culturally Responsive Online Courses

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office
ONLINE EQUITY FRAMEWORK

Example Online Programs
- West Los Angeles College
- MiraCosta

Involves
- Research
- Review Process using AI
- PD
- Positive impact online and f-2-f
ONLINE EQUITY FRAMEWORK

Counseling
• LA Mission College
• WLAC (Counseling 20)

Tutoring (SI Leaders, Tutors)
• WLAC
• Riverside City College
• Pierce
ONLINE EQUITY FRAMEWORK

**Professional Development**
- Equity and CRTL in the Online Learning Environment (Porter & Torres, 2018)
- Counseling (in progress, 2018)
- Tutoring (in progress, 2018)

**Example Courses**
- Equity/CRTL Sessions (CRTL Principles, Welcome Package, Syllabus & Curriculum Redesign, Language, NameCoach)
- **English 101** (WLAC, 2018)
- **Counseling 20** (WLAC, 2018)
- **Math 201**, Elementary Statistics (Lake Tahoe, 2017)
What’s Next
Online Statistics

• Standard Transfer Course for Most Students
• Should Not Be a Barrier
• Diverse Collection of Students
• Represents All of California
• Share Course with Many Other Faculty

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office
Online Equity Challenge

• Can’t “See” Students
• Can Be Isolating
• How to Be Culturally Sensitive Without Face-To-Face Meeting?
• Solution: Regular Meetings with Arnita
Equity Strategies

• NameCoach
• Welcoming Instead of Harsh Sounding Syllabus
• Discussion Articles Chosen by Students
• Project Partners
Statistics Question Bank

- Questions that refer to fair practices
- 50% “She” and 50% “He”
- Name Randomizer

```r
# Code snippet
$anstypes = fillarray("number",13)
loadlibrary("stats")
$showanswerstyle = "inline"
$name = randnames(1)
$x = rands(5,20,5)
$table = showdataarray($x,5)
$mu = mean($x)
$answer[0] = $mu
```
Where to Go From Here

- Current Grant to Expand to All Math Courses
- Will Use Same Equity Glasses
- Move from 50 to 50,000 to 1,500,000 students
- OEI, OER, and Equity Conscious
THANK YOU!

Online Counseling, Peer Mentoring, Readiness

**Bonnie Peters & Jessica Hurtado**
Chief Student Services Officer (CSSO)
Online Education Initiative
bpeters@ccconlineed.org & jhurtado@ccconlineed.org

Online Student Equity

**Arnita Porter**
Online Student Equity Coordinator, Student Services
aporter@ccconlineed.org

Online Tutoring & Online Proctoring

**Logan Murray**
Project Analyst, Academic Affairs
CCC Online Education Initiative (OEI)
lmurray@ccconlineed.org